

# **Does History Matter?**

**Making and debating citizenship,  
immigration and refugee policy in  
Australia and New Zealand**



# Does History Matter?

Making and debating citizenship,  
immigration and refugee policy in  
Australia and New Zealand

Edited by Klaus Neumann and Gwenda Tavan



E P R E S S



Published by ANU E Press  
The Australian National University  
Canberra ACT 0200, Australia  
Email: [anuepress@anu.edu.au](mailto:anuepress@anu.edu.au)  
This title is also available online at: [http://epress.anu.edu.au/immigration\\_citation.html](http://epress.anu.edu.au/immigration_citation.html)

---

National Library of Australia  
Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

Title: Does history matter? : making and debating citizenship, immigration and refugee policy in Australia and New Zealand / editors Klaus Neumann, Gwenda Tavan.

ISBN: 9781921536946 (pbk.) 9781921536953 (pdf)

Series: ANZSOG series.

Subjects: Citizenship--Australia.  
Citizenship--New Zealand.  
Refugees--Government policy--Australia.  
Refugees--Government policy--New Zealand.  
Australia--Emigration and immigration--Government policy.  
New Zealand--Emigration and immigration--Government policy.

Other Authors/Contributors:  
Neumann, Klaus, 1958-  
Tavan, Gwenda.

Dewey Number: 323.63

---

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Cover design by John Butcher

Printed by University Printing Services, ANU  
Funding for this monograph series has been provided by the Australia and New Zealand School of Government Research Program.

This edition © 2009 ANU E Press

## **John Wanna, *Series Editor***



Professor John Wanna is the Sir John Bunting Chair of Public Administration at the Research School of Social Sciences at The Australian National University and is the director of research for the Australian and New Zealand School of Government (ANZSOG). He is also a joint appointment with the Department of Politics and Public Policy at Griffith University and a principal researcher with two research centres: the Governance and Public Policy Research Centre and the nationally-funded Key Centre in Ethics, Law, Justice and Governance at Griffith University.



# Table of Contents

Foreword	vii
<i>Malcolm Fraser</i>	
Contributors	xi
Acknowledgments	xv
Abbreviations and acronyms	xvii
Introduction	1
1. Gone with hardly a trace: deportees in immigration policy	9
<i>Glenn Nicholls</i>	
2. The unfinished business of Indigenous citizenship in Australia and New Zealand	25
<i>Roderic Pitty</i>	
3. Oblivious to the obvious? Australian asylum-seeker policies and the use of the past	47
<i>Klaus Neumann</i>	
4. 'A modern-day concentration camp': using history to make sense of Australian immigration detention centres	65
<i>Amy Nethery</i>	
5. Refugees between pasts and politics: sovereignty and memory in the Tampa crisis	81
<i>J. Olaf Kleist</i>	
6. Looking back and glancing sideways: refugee policy and multicultural nation-building in New Zealand	105
<i>Ann Beaglehole</i>	
7. Testing times: the problem of 'history' in the Howard Government's Australian citizenship test	125
<i>Gwenda Tavan</i>	
Afterword	145
<i>Klaus Neumann</i>	
Select bibliography	151